#### Topological Phases of Matter: Modeling and Application to Quantum Computing



Zhenghan Wang Microsoft Station Q Santa Barbara, CA

# Outline

- Modeling of fractional quantum Hall liquids
- Theory of topological phases of matter
- Topological quantum computation

## **Classical Hall effect**

On a new action of the magnet on electric currents Am. J. Math. Vol. 2, No. 3, 287—292 E. H. Hall, 1879

"It must be carefully remembered, that the mechanical force which urges a conductor carrying a current across the lines of magnetic force, acts, not on the electric current, but on the conductor which carries it..."

Maxwell, Electricity and Magnetism Vol. II, p.144

#### Birth of Integer Quantum Hall Effect





New Method for High-Accuracy Determination of the Fine-Structure Constant Based on Quantized Hall Resistance,

> K. v. Klitzing, G. Dorda and M. Pepper Phys. Rev. Lett. 45, 494 (1980).

These experimental data, available to the public 3 years before the discovery of the quantum Hall effect, contain already all information of this new quantum effect so that everyone had the chance to make a discovery that led to the Nobel Prize in Physics 1985. The unexpected finding in the night of 4./5.2.1980 was the fact, that the plateau values in the Hall resistance x-y are not influenced by the amount of localized electrons and can be expressed with high precision by the equation  $R_H = \frac{h}{Ve^2}$ 



#### Fractional Quantum Hall Effect



D. Tsui enclosed the distance between B=0 and the position of the last IQHE between two fingers of one hand and measured the position of the new feature in this unit. He determined it to be three and exclaimed, "quarks!" H. Stormer

The FQHE is fascinating for a long list of reasons, but it is important, in my view, primarily for one: It established experimentally that both particles carrying an exact fraction of the electron charge e and powerful gauge forces between these particles, two central postulates of the standard model of elementary particles, can arise spontaneously as emergent phenomena. R. Laughlin



In 1998, Laughlin, Stormer, and Tsui are awarded the Nobel Prize

*" for their discovery of a new form of quantum fluid with fractionally charged excitations."* 

D. C. Tsui, H. L. Stormer, and A. C. Gossard Phys. Rev. Lett. 48, 1559 (1982)



$$v = \frac{N_e}{N_{\phi}}$$

filling factor or fraction  $N_e = \#$  of electrons  $N_{\phi} = \#$  of flux quanta

How to model the quantum state(s) at a filling fraction?

What are the electrons doing at a plateau?



# Fractional Quantum Hall Liquids

N electrons in a plane bound to the interface between two semiconductors immersed in a perpendicular magnetic field



Classes of ground state wave functions that have similar properties or no phase transitions as  $N \rightarrow \infty$  (N ~  $10^{11} cm^{-2}$ )

Interaction is dynamical entanglement and quantum order is materialized entanglement

#### Fundamental Hamiltonian:

$$\mathsf{H} = \Sigma_1^N \left\{ \frac{1}{2m} \left[ \nabla_j - \mathsf{q} \mathsf{A}(z_j) \right]^2 + V_{bg}(z_j) \right\} + \Sigma_{j < k} \mathsf{V}(z_j - z_k)$$

Ideal Hamiltonian:  $H = \Sigma_1^N \{ \frac{1}{2m} [\nabla_j - q A(z_j)]^2 \} + ?, \text{ e.g. } \Sigma_{j < k} \delta(z_j - z_k) \quad z_j \text{ position of } j\text{-th electron} \}$ 

### Laughlin wave function for v=1/3 Laughlin 1983

Good trial wavefunction for N electrons at z<sub>i</sub> in ground state

$$\Psi_{1/3} = \prod_{i < j} (\mathbf{z}_i - \mathbf{z}_j)^3 \, \mathbf{e}^{-\sum_i |\mathbf{z}_i|^2/4}$$

#### **Physical Theorem:**



- 1. Laughlin state is incompressible: density and gap in limit (Laughlin 83)
- 2. Elementary excitations have charge e/3 (Laughlin 83)
- 3. Elementary excitations are abelian anyons (Arovas-Schrieffer-Wilczek 84)

#### **Experimental Confirmation:**

**1.** and **2.**  $\sqrt{}$ , but **3.** ?, thus Laughlin wave function is a good model

## Excitations=Anyons

#### Quasi-holes/particles in v=1/3 are abelian anyons

 $\psi \rightarrow e^{\pi i/3} \psi$ 



$$\begin{split} \Psi_{1/3} &= \prod_{k} (\eta_{0} - \mathbf{z}_{j})^{3} \prod_{i < j} (\mathbf{z}_{i} - \mathbf{z}_{j})^{3} \mathbf{e}^{-\sum_{i} |\mathbf{z}_{i}|^{2}/4} \\ &= \prod_{k} (\eta_{1} - \mathbf{z}_{j}) \prod_{k} (\eta_{2} - \mathbf{z}_{j}) \prod_{k} (\eta_{3} - \mathbf{z}_{j}) \prod_{i < j} (\mathbf{z}_{i} - \mathbf{z}_{j})^{3} \mathbf{e}^{-\sum_{i} |\mathbf{z}_{i}|^{2}/4} \end{split}$$

n anyons at well-separated  $\eta_i$ , i=1,2,.., n, there is a **unique** ground state

### Moore-Read or Pfaffian State

G. Moore, N. Read 1991

Pfaffian wave function (MR w/ ~ charge sector)  $\Psi_{1/2} = Pf(1/(z_i - z_j)) \prod_{i < j} (z_i - z_j)^2 e^{-\sum_i |z_i|^2/4}$ 

Pfaffian of a 2n×2n anti-symmetric matrix  $M=(a_{ij})$  is  $\omega^n = n! Pf(M) dx^1 \wedge dx^2 \wedge \dots \wedge dx^{2n}$  if  $\omega = \sum_{i < j} a_{ij} dx^i \wedge dx^j$ 

**Physical Theorem:** 

- 1. Pfaffian state is gapped
- Elementary excitations are non-abelian anyons, called Ising anyon σ
   ..... Read 09

### Non-abelian Anyons in Pfaffian State

• 1-qh: Pf 
$$(\frac{(\eta - z_i)(\eta - z_j)}{z_i - z_j})$$
  
• 2-qh: Pf $(\frac{(\eta_1 - z_i)(\eta_2 - z_j) + (\eta_1 - z_j)(\eta_2 - z_i)}{z_i - z_j})$   
• 4-qh:  $P_{[12,34]} = Pf(\frac{(\eta_1 - z_i)(\eta_2 - z_i)(\eta_3 - z_j)(\eta_4 - z_j) + (i \leftrightarrow j)}{z_i - z_j})$   
 $P_{[13,24]}, P_{[14,23]}.$ 

There is one linear relation among the three. (Nayak-Wilczek 96)

Anyons w/ degeneracy in the plane are non-abelian anyons.

# Enigma of v=5/2 FQHE

#### R. Willett et al discovered v=5/2 in1987

- Moore-Read State, Wen 1991
- Greiter-Wilczek-Wen 1991
- Nayak-Wilczek 1996
- Morf 1998
- •

MR (maybe some variation) is a good trial state for 5/2

• Bonderson, Gurarie, Nayak 2011,

A landmark (physical) proof for the MR state

"Now we eagerly await the next great step: experimental confirmation." ----Wilczek

**Experimental confirmation of 5/2:** 

gap and charge e/4  $\sqrt{}$ , but non-abelian anyons ???



Willett et al, PRL 59 1987

### Wave functions of **bosonic** FQH liquids

• Chirality:

 $\Psi(z_1,...,z_N)$  is a polynomial (Ignore Gaussian)

• Statistics:

**symmetric**=anti-symmetric divided by  $\Pi_{i < j}(z_i - z_j)$ 

Translation invariant:

 $\Psi(z_1+c,...,z_N+c) = \Psi(z_1,...,z_N)$  for any c

• Filling fraction:

v=lim 
$$\frac{N}{N_{\phi}}$$
, where  $N_{\phi}$  is max degree of any  $z_i$ 

## Pattern of zeros

joint work with X.-G. Wen

W.F. { $\Psi(z_1,...,z_N)$ } "vanish" at certain powers {S<sub>a</sub>} when a particles are brought together, a=1,2,...:

 $\Psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N) = \sum c_I Z^I, I = (i_1,\ldots,i_N),$ 

 $S_a = \min{\{\sum_{i=1}^{a} i_i\}}$ ---minimal total degrees of a variables.

Morally,  $\{S_a\} \approx$  ideal wave function  $\approx$  ideal Hamiltonian

These powers  $\{S_a\}$  should be consistent to represent the same local physics of the quantum phase, and encode many topological properties of the FQH state.

## Conformal field theory examples

Laughlin:  $S_a = qa(a-1)/2$ , v=1/qPfaffian:  $S_a = a(a-1)/2 - [a/2]$ , v=1 bosonic

In a CFT, if V<sub>e</sub> is chosen as the electron operator and a conformal block as a W.F. If V<sub>a</sub>=(V<sub>e</sub>)<sup>a</sup> has scaling dimension h<sub>a</sub>, then  $S_a = h_a - a h_1$ 

## **Classification of FQH states**

Find necessary and sufficient conditions for patterns of zeros

- a) to be realized by polynomials
- b) to represent a topological phase

Thm (Wen, W.) If translation inv. symm. polys.  $\{\Psi(z_i)\}$  satisfy UFC and nCF for n, then

- 1) Set  $m=S_{n+1}-S_n$ , mn even, and v=n/m
- 2)  $S_{a+b}$ - $S_{a}$ - $S_{b} \ge 0$
- 3)  $S_{a+b+c}$ - $S_{a+b}$ - $S_{b+c}$ - $S_{c+a}$ + $S_a$ + $S_b$ + $S_c \ge 0$
- 4) S<sub>2a</sub> even
- 5) 2S<sub>n</sub>=0 mod n
- 6)  $S_{a+kn} = S_a + kS_n + kma + k(k-1)mn/2$

Further works with Y. Lu and Z. Wang show pattern of zeros is not complete, though many topological properties can be derived from pattern of zeros.

More complete data use vertex operator algebra.

Puzzle: Need to impose  $S_{a+b+c}-S_{a+b}-S_{b+c}-S_{c+a}+S_a+S_b+S_c$  to be EVEN!

### Theory of Topological Phases of Matter

- Low energy effective theory is a topological quantum field theory (TQFT)
- Quantum information characterization
  - 1) error correction codes Kitaev, Freedman, Bravyi-Hastings-Michalakis
  - 2) long range entanglement Kitaev-Preskill, Levin-Wen

# Sensitivity to Topology

Given a theory H, i.e. a Hamiltonian schema, and a surface Y, put H on Y. Let V(Y) be its ground state manifold, (ground state (GS) manifold=Hilbert space of GSs. Degenerate if Dim GS manifold > 1)

e.g. "Laughlin w.f."s on  $T^2$  consist of classical  $\theta$ -functions, which form a 3-dimensional Hilbert space.

So Laughlin theory has a 3-fold degeneracy on torus ( $3^g$  on genus g surface.)

Ground state degeneracy depends on topology.

## **TQFT** as Effective Theory

A theory H is topological if the functor Surface  $Y \rightarrow V(Y)$  (GS manifold) is a TQFT.

Rm: H is the Hamiltonian for all degrees of freedom. Restricted to the topological degrees of freedom, the effective Hamiltonian is constant (or 0).

Physical Thm: Topological properties of abelian bosonic FQH liquids are modeled by Witten-Chern-Simons theories with abelian gauge groups  $T^n$ .

Conjecture: NA statistics sectors of FQH liquids at  $v=2+\frac{k}{k+2}$  are modeled by  $SU(2)_k$ -WCS theories.  $k=1,2,3,4, v=\frac{7}{3}, \frac{5}{2}, \frac{13}{5}, \frac{8}{3}$ . (Read-Rezayi). 5/2  $\sqrt{$ 

Atiyah's Axioms of (2+1)-TQFT (TQFT w/o excitations and anomaly)

A functor (V,Z): category of surfaces  $\rightarrow$  Vec

(Hilbert spaces for unitary TQFTs)

Oriented closed surface  $Y \rightarrow$  vector space V(Y) Oriented 3-mfd X with  $\partial X=Y \rightarrow$  vector Z(X) $\in$ V( $\partial X$ )

- V(∅) ≅ C
- $V(Y_1 \cup Y_2) \cong V(Y_1) \otimes V(Y_2)$
- $V(-Y) \cong V^*(Y)$
- $Z(Y \times I) = Id_{V(Y)}$
- $Z(X_1 \cup_Y X_2) = Z(X_1) \cdot Z(X_2)$



### **Modeling Anyons**

Put a theory H on a closed surface Y with anyons  $a_1, a_2, ..., a_n$  at  $\eta_1, ..., \eta_n$  (punctures), the (relative) ground states of the system "outside"  $\eta_1, ..., \eta_n$  is a Hilbert space V(Y;  $a_1, a_2, ..., a_n$ ). For anyons in a surface w/ boundaries (e.g. a disk), the boundaries need conditions.



Stable boundary conditions correspond to anyon types (labels, super-selection sectors, topological charges). Moreover, each puncture (anyon) needs a tangent direction, so anyon is modeled by a small arrow, not a point. Topological twist:

$$\left( \sum_{l=0}^{l} \right)$$

 $\theta_l \neq 1$  in general

### **Non-abelian Anyons**

Given n anyons of type x in a disk D, their ground state degeneracy

dim(V(D,x,...,x))= $D_n \sim d^n$ 

The asymptotic growth rate d is called the quantum dimension.

An anyon d=1 is called an abelian anyon, e.g. Laughlin anyon, d=1 An anyon with d >1 is an non-abelian anyon, e.g. the Ising anyon  $\sigma$ , d= $\sqrt{2}$ . For n even,  $D_n = \frac{1}{2} 2^{\frac{n}{2}}$  with fixed boundary conditions, n odd,  $D_n = 2^{\frac{n-1}{2}}$ . (Nayak-Wilczek 96)

Degeneracy for non-abelian anyons in a disk grows exponentially with # of anyons, while for an abelian anyon, no degeneracy---it is always 1.

## (Extended) TQFT Axioms

Moore-Seiberg, Walker, Turaev,...

Let L={a,b,c,...d} be the labels (particle types),  $a \rightarrow a^*$ , and  $a^{**}=a$ , 0 (or 1) =trivial type

Disk Axiom: V(D²; a)=0 if a≠ 0, C if a=0

Annulus Axiom: V(A; a,b)=0 if a≠ b\*, C if a=b\*

Gluing Axiom: V(Y; I)  $\cong \bigoplus_{x \in L} V(Y_{cut}; I, x, x^*)$ 



a

b

 $\mathbf{x} \ \mathbf{x}^*$ 

## Algebraic Structure of Anyons

L={a,b,c,...d} a label set and  $P_{ab,c}$  a pair of pants labeled by a,b,c.  $N_{ab,c}$ =dim V( $P_{ab,c}$ ), then  $N_{ab,c}$  is the fusion rule of the theory.

a⊗b=⊕
$$N_{ab,c}$$
c

Every orientable surface Y can be cut into disks D, annuli A, and pairs of pants. If V(D), V(A), V( $P_{ab,c}$ ) are known, then V(Y) is determined by the gluing axiom. Conversely a TQFT can be constructed from V(Y) of disk, annulus and pair of pants. Need **consistent conditions: a modular tensor category Unitary modular categories (UMC)** are algebraic data of unitary TQFTs and algebraic theories of anyons: anyon=simple object, fusion=tensor product, statistics of anyons are representations of the mapping class groups.

#### Rank < 5 Unitary Modular Categories joint work w/ E. Rowell and R. Stong

	A		1									
		Trivial										
	A		2				NA		2			
		Semion						Fib				
							BU					
	A		2	NA		8	NA		2			
		(U(1),3)			Ising			(SO(3),5)				
							BU					
A 5	A		4	NA		4	NA		2	NA		3
Toric code	(U(1),4)			Fib x Semion			(SO(3),7)			DFib		
				BU			BU			BU		

The ith-row is the classification of all rank=i unitary modular tensor categories. Middle symbol: fusion rule. Upper left corner: A=abelian theoy, NA=nonabelian. Upper right corner number=the number of distinct theories. Lower left corner BU=there is a universal braiding anyon.

## Code Subspace Property

Conjecture: H:  $V_{\Gamma} \rightarrow V_{\Gamma}$  is a topological theory on a lattice  $\Gamma$  (graph in a surface Y), where  $V_{\Gamma} = \bigotimes_{e \in \Gamma} C^m$  for some m, then GS(H)  $\subset V_{\Gamma}$  is an error correction code.

If true, then local operators do not act on the ground states For some k, all k-local operators  $O_k: V_{\Gamma} \rightarrow V_{\Gamma}$  the following composition is  $\lambda \bullet Id$  for some scalar  $\lambda$  (possibly 0),

 $\mathsf{GS}(\mathsf{H}) \subset V_{\Gamma} \longrightarrow V_{\Gamma} \twoheadrightarrow \mathsf{GS}(\mathsf{H})$ 

GS manifolds are fault-tolerant quantum memory.

# Kitaev's Toric Code

 $H = \sum_{v} (I - A_{v}) + \sum_{p} (I - B_{p})$ 



 $V = \otimes_{edges} C^{2}$  $A_{v} = \otimes_{e \in v} \sigma^{z} \otimes_{others} Id_{e},$  $B_{p} = \otimes_{e \in p} \sigma^{x} \otimes_{others} Id_{e},$ 

### GS Manifolds as Quantum Memory

- Thm: If a TQFT is from a Drinfeld center (or quantum double), then GS manifolds of the Levin-Wen model/Kitaev model are error correction codes.
- Chiral theories (those with anomaly)? Open including all WCS theories so FQH states
  a) a holographic solution by Walker-W.
  b) local degrees of freedom might be infinite.

Topological phases of matter exist in both real systems (FQHE) and theories, what are they good for?

#### **Topological Quantum Computation**

#### Freedman 97, Kitaev 97, FKW 00, FLW 00



## **Mathematical Theorems**

Theorem 1 (FKW): Any unitary TQFT can be efficiently simulated by the quantum circuit model.

There are efficient additive approximation algorithms of quantum invariants by the quantum circuit model.

Theorem 2 (FLW): Anyonic quantum computers based on SU(2)-Chern-Simons theory at level k are braiding universal except k=1,2,4.

The approximation of Jones poly of links at the (k+2)<sup>th</sup> root of unity (k≠1,2,4) is a BQ(F)P-complete problem.

Estimation of braid closure is DQC1-complete for k=3 (Shor-Jordan 07)

Exact or FPRAS approximation of Jones poly of links at the (k+2)th root of unity (k≠1,2,4) is #P-hard. (Vertigan 05, Kuperberg 09)

### **Density Theorem**

- In 1981, Jones proved that  $\rho_{SU(2),k,l}(B_n)$  is infinite
- if  $k \neq 1,2,4$  n  $\geq 3$  or k=8, n  $\geq 4$  (k=r-2).
- and asked:
- What are the closed images of  $\rho_{SU(2),k,l}(B_n)$ ?

- Theorem (FLW 02):
- Always contain SU if  $k \neq 1,2,4$ ,  $n \ge 3$  or k=8,  $n \ge 4$ .
- Others are finite groups which can be identified (using the classification of simple groups for all SU(n) theories).

### FQHE at v=5/2 w/ $\approx$ charge sector The effective theory is Ising TQFT

(Fradkin-Nayak-Tsvelik-Wilczek 98)



#### Ising Quantum Computer

4 Ising  $\sigma$ 's in a disk is C<sup>2</sup>-qubit. 6  $\sigma$ 's C<sup>4</sup>-2 qubits. For 1-qubit gates,  $\rho$ : B<sub>4</sub>  $\rightarrow$  U(2) For 2-qubits gates,  $\rho$ : B<sub>6</sub>  $\rightarrow$  U(4)



## **Ising Braiding Gates**



 $\sigma_1 \sigma_2 \neq \sigma_2 \sigma_1$ 



#### Fibonacci TQFT (FQHE at v=12/5?) G<sub>2</sub> level=1 CFT, c=14/5 mod 8

 $\tau^2 = 1 \oplus \tau$ 

- Particle types:  $\{1,\tau\}, \tau$ ---Fib anyon
- Quantum dimensions:  $\{1,\phi\}, \phi=$ golden ratio
- Fusion rules:
- Braiding:

• Twist:  $=e^{4\pi i/5}$ 

Fibonacci Quantum Computer for n qubits, consider the 4n Fibonacci anyons  $\rho: B_{4n} \rightarrow U(F_{4n-2}), F_{4n-2}$ ---4n-2 Fib number

Given a quantum circuit on n qubits

$$\mathsf{U}_{\mathsf{L}}: (\mathsf{C}^2)^{\otimes \mathsf{n}} \longrightarrow (\mathsf{C}^2)^{\otimes \mathsf{n}}$$

**Topological compiling:** find a braid  $b \in B_{4n}$  so that the following commutes for any  $U_L$ :

 $V_{4n}$ -gs of 4n anyons

# **Universal Braiding Gates**

- Ising anyon  $\sigma$  does not lead to universal braiding gates, but Fib anyon  $\tau$  does
- Quantum dimension of Ising anyon  $\sigma$  has quantum dimension= $\sqrt{2}$ , while Fib anyon  $\tau$  has quantum dimension  $\phi = (\sqrt{5}+1)/2$ ---golden ratio
- Given an anyon type x, when does it lead to universal braiding gate sets ?
   Related: Can a NA-anyon has its own local Hilbert space---an explicit locality of TQFT? No! Someway?

### Yang-Baxterizable Anyon joint work w/ E. Rowell

# Conjecture: An anyon type x does not lead to universal braiding gates

if and only if its quantum dimension  $d_x$  is  $\sqrt{q}$  for some integer q

if and only it is Yang-Baxterizable:

there is a unitary R-matrix R such that the rep  $V_{n,x}$  of the n-strand braid group  $B_n$  from x is Yang-Baxterized by R for all n in the sense:

et 
$$V_{n,x} = \bigoplus V_{n,x,l}$$
, then  
 $\bigoplus m_{n,x,l} \quad V_{n,x,l} \cong V_{n,R}$ 

for some  $m_{n,x,l}$ , and  $V_{n,R}$ -the rep of  $B_n$  from R-matrix R

#### Are we close to confirm non-abelian anyons?



#### Quasiparticle interferometer

For an odd number of quasiholes on an antidot, we have *no* interference!

 $\sigma_{xx} \propto \left| t_1 \right|^2 + \left| t_2 \right|^2, \qquad n \text{ odd}$ 

The interference pattern for an even number of quasiholes is

 $\sigma_{xx} \propto \left| t_1 \right|^2 + \left| t_2 \right|^2 + (-1)^{N_{\psi}} 2 \left| t_1 \right| \left| t_2 \right| \cos \left( \beta + n \frac{\pi}{4} \right), \quad n \text{ even}$ 

This even-odd effect is drastically different from the Abelian case!

Freedman, Nayak, Das Sarma, 2005

Halperin-Stern 06 Bonderson-Kitaev-Shtengel 06

Willett reported data 09 Heiblum data on neutral mode Spin polarization?

#### Challenging:

Little correlation between anyons and local measurement

Extreme conditions

Can we do better? We have to build a small topological quantum computer to confirm non-abelian anyons



## Some References

- Computing with Quantum Knots, Graham P. Collins Scientific American **4**, 57 (2006).
- Fractional statistics and anyon superconductivity a book of classical papers on anyons---F. Wilczek
- Topological quantum computation---J. Preskill http://www.theory.caltech.edu/~preskill/ph219/
- Non-abelian anyons and topological quantum computation
   C. Nayak et al, Rev. Mod. Phys. 2008, Arxiv 0707.1889
- Topological quantum computation---CBMS monograph vol. 115 (Z.W.)

